# Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission June 13, 2024 at 7:30PM – Meeting Minutes

# Roll Call

Present:	Acting Chair Asha Andriana and Commissioners David Bates, Monique Chase, Scot
	Mazur, Amy Peterson, Ron Roman, and Mark Weiner
Absent:	Commissioners Jessica Paul and Ron Roman; Chair Lou Garapolo
Staff:	Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

# Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Chase to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Bates. Motion approved 6-0.

#### Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

# <u>Minutes</u>

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to approve the minutes from May 9, 2024. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 6-0.

#### **Regular Agenda**

A. HPC2024-10: 100 Home Ave (Doran Swan & Jennifer Cutilletta): Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to front porch (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Andriana introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary and recommended the Commission might discuss the baluster spacing and let the applicant know if they have preferences. She said Chair Garapolo provided a written comment. He agreed with the staff report and applauds the owner's desire to historically restore the porch.

Tracey Brewer, the architect, was present. She said the balusters are 1.5" wide so they propose spacing them at 4" on center as that would leave a 2" gap. She said leaving a 3" gap would be challenging for the contractor. She said everything will be painted wood and the intent is to match the historic photo. The posts will not be turned as they need to be fire-treated wood this close to the property line.

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Chase.

Commissioner Weiner said he likes what they're doing with the porch. It's well thought-out and preserving as well as they can within building code.

Commissioner Peterson said she was excited to see this project come up. She said she sees this house all the time and there's so much beautiful detail. She said the original photo seems to show a

metal railing at the stairs but she likes the balustrade there. Ms. Brewer said this is a code requirement.

Commissioner Chase said she likes the project. She recommended they look into salvaging the breezeblock. Some of the patterns are hard to come by.

Acting Chair Andriana said she supports the project.

*Commissioner Weiner made a motion to approve the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 6-0.* 

AYE: Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, Commissioner Weiner, and Acting Chair Andriana

NAY: None

**B.** HPC2024-11: 400 N Scoville Ave (Paul & Sonya Greenwalt): Certificate of Appropriateness to alter windows on the rear of a house on a corner lot (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Andriana introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She said the applicant just added the information that the bay may have been built in the 1930s or 1940s to create a larger dining room area. The original rear elevation, which has been added to the report, does not show the bay. She said Chair Garapolo provided a written comment. He said he agrees with the staff report.

The applicant was not present. Acting Chair Andriana and the Commission agreed to review the project without the applicant.

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Bates.

The Commission seemed generally in favor of the project. Commissioner Peterson said if it was built before 1941, it would still be considered historic even if not original, but she is in favor of the project.

Commissioner Chase said she's in favor of the project and approves of both options, with or without the trim at the infilled windows.

*Commissioner Weiner made a motion to approve the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Bates. Motion approved 6-0.* 

AYE: Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, Commissioner Weiner, and Acting Chair Andriana

NAY: None

C. HPC2024-12: 815 N Elmwood Ave (Jill & Neil Benchell): Certificate of Appropriateness for twostory, side addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Andriana introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She said Chair Garapolo provided a written comment. He said he agrees with the staff report.

Daniel Meeker, the architect, was present for the project. He said the homeowners have had the property since the early 1990s. They want to expand to allow for multiple generations to live in the house. He explained the added space and said the bow window is intended to display their glass collection. He said they added a small eave at the first level to tie to the front porch and break up the mass. Mr. Meeker showed the renderings and said there are some precedents on Elmwood for bow windows in the Prairie style. There's also many side entries and side additions on the block.

# Motion by Commissioner Weiner to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Bates.

Commissioner Chase asked if the bay window will have the same mullions as the front of the house. Mr. Meeker said it will have the Prairie style array, which is found on the front porch. Commissioner Peterson said she appreciates how far the addition was set back. She said she knows it's close to the lot line. She asked if the neighboring house as more space on the left. Mr. Meeker said their entry is on the left side. They're pretty close to the lot line but have lots of open space in the back.

*Commissioner Weiner made a motion to approve the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Peterson. Motion approved 6-0.* 

AYE: Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, Commissioner Weiner, and Acting Chair Andriana

NAY: None

**D.** HPC2024-13: 117 S Ridgeland Ave (Stacy Frattinger & Jamie Pfluecke): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish historic garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Andriana introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She said Chair Garapolo provided a written comment. He said the submittal is not sufficient. The information does not fully address a restoration option. The owner should provide further information.

Attending for the project were David Krecek, the contractor, and Stacy Frattinger and Jamie Pfluecke, the homeowners. Mr. Pfluecke said everything on the interior and exterior needs to be replaced. It's approaching non-functional. The staircase is 4.5' wide. The concrete slab is completely deteriorated and sunken 4-5 inches in places. The roof and walls need to be replaced. There's no room for a charging station. He said they're one of two historic garages left on the block. It's a matter of functionality combined with space.

Mr. Krecek said the entire building is not code compliant. He explained what it would take to repair the building. He said the entire building has shifted and the walls are bulging outward. It's balloon construction, which is no longer permitted for this height. He said if all the repairs he discussed were needed, the cost would probably be \$80,000 and he still wouldn't guarantee the project.

# Motion by Commissioner Weiner to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Chase.

Commissiner Chase asked staff if Chair Garapolo saw the photos with the level. Planner Trexler said some photos were submitted this evening, so Chair Garapolo did not see all of them. Commissioner Chase said photos with a level are often what they ask for. It's sad to see this garage go.

Commissioner Peterson said the engineer's report didn't mention anything being out of plumb or falling down. She asked for more information about that. Ms. Frattinger explained some of the

issues they have with the garage including concern that they will fall through the second floor and they keep fixing the garage door. She said their cars don't fit. The want a functional garage.

Commissioner Peterson said the estimates for repair didn't include some aspects. Ms. Frattinger agreed and listed some of the items not included. Commissioner Peterson said this is one of the last garages on that block. Ms. Frattinger said if there is something worth keeping, like the window, they would be happy to keep them. Mr. Pfluecke said they would build a building in a similar style that's a single story. They also have a wide lot so can place it where less visible.

Commissioner Weiner asked if the cost to demolish the garage and build new is \$67,000. Ms. Frattinger said yes, approximately. Commissioner Weiner asked if repair is \$80,000 and they'd want to add on to that? Ms. Frattinger confirmed and said they'd need more room. Commissioner Weiner asked if they use the second floor currently. Ms. Frattinger said they store stuff up there but it doesn't come down. She said they haven't been up there in 10 years.

*Commissioner Weiner made a motion to approve the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Peterson. Motion approved 6-0.* 

AYE: Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, Commissioner Weiner, and Acting Chair Andriana

NAY: None

# **Other Business**

Planner Trexler thanked the Commissioners who volunteered at Day in Our Village. Commissioner Peterson said the maps were popular, the style board drew people in, and the QR code handout was helpful.

# ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Peterson.

The meeting adjourned at 8:20PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.